

Annual Review - Summary Sheet

This Summary Sheet captures the headlines on programme performance, agreed actions and learning over the course of the review period. It should be attached to all subsequent reviews to build a complete picture of actions and learning throughout the life of the programme.

Title: AAWAZ Voice and Accountability Programme

Programme Value: £37.2 million

Review Date: May 2017

Programme Code: 114433

Start Date: May 2012

End Date: May 2018

Summary of Programme Performance

| Year | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | | | |
|-----------------|-----------------|--------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|--|--|--|
| Programme Score | B | A | A | A+ | A++ | | | |
| Risk Rating | Moderate | Minor | Moderate | Moderate | Moderate | | | |

Summary of progress and lessons learnt since last review

An internal independent team conducted this annual review by undertaking field visits, meetings with partners and drawing on monitoring and evaluation reports.

AAWAZ is DFID Pakistan's standalone demand-side voice and accountability programme, supporting citizens to access information about their rights, resolve conflict at the local-level, and raise demands effectively about gaps in essential services. It aims to ensure that democratic processes are more open, inclusive and accountable to citizens in Pakistan. It focuses on three areas:

- Women's and minority rights, their political participation and decision making;
- Tolerance and prevention of violence (inter-faith, sectarian and gender-based);
- Increasing the accountability and responsiveness of the state to citizens' demands for improved service delivery (particularly on health and education).

Working with young people has been a new focus in the reporting year, and the development themes of political empowerment, identity-based discrimination and violence, gaps in basic service delivery, and bonded labour have been prominent.

AAWAZ built on its success in 2016 to achieve significant and impressive results. It met almost every indicator milestone (41 out of 43), and some by a very considerable margin. It made significant strides on supporting national legislation to support women, girls and religious minorities. It also achieved significant results in shifting knowledge, attitudes and practices to support more tolerant and safe societies in Pakistan. Finally, it also had a significant impact through its work equipping people with the skills and tools to engage with government on basic service delivery.

Highlights of progress include:

- a) AAWAZ now has 198,118 direct members (98,635 women, 99,347 men, and 136 transgender people) of AAWAZ Village Forums (AVFs) and AAWAZ District Forums (ADFs). This includes 1,845 women trained as master trainers or change agents;
- b) The 'Knowledge Attitudes and Practices' survey demonstrates that 93% of respondents now believe that domestic violence is a crime (compared to 61% in 2016);
- c) Recommendations from the previous Annual Review, on deepening the investment in leaders in communities to sustain momentum, have been followed through. There has been increased investment in Women Assemblies and 418 youth circles of influence¹ established.
- d) AAWAZ supported 189,245 women to register for their CNICs (Computerised National Identity Cards), and 161,735 women to register as voters. This took place alongside wide-ranging work

¹ Youth 'circles of influence' are social networks through which youth leaders share information, support discussion and support action on priority thematic areas (including women's rights, tolerance for all religious beliefs, hate speech, and inclusion).

- on political empowerment at informal and formal levels (like women leadership in AVFs, or facilitating women running for positions in local elections);
- e) AAWAZ built on the preventative approach taken last year on conflict prevention, preventing sectarian, inter-faith or gender-based violence in communities. This prevention of conflict affected 4.34 million additional people positively in the reporting year. Early Warning Systems (EWS) were assessed and over 93% of the community members were satisfied with the process and effectiveness of the response mechanisms;
 - f) Citizens were trained and supported in making 5,168 demands during the reporting year, which led to a total of 9,544 demands met (the majority in health and education), including follow through on demands made in previous years;
 - g) Monitoring and evaluation systems were improved significantly, and the response fund invested in critical pilot work through small grants, including a project addressing corruption and modern slavery for sanitary workers.

Summary of recommendations for the next year

These recommendations will be tracked by the programme team in their regular discussions with programme partners.

Ensure sustainability and build beyond this foundation

- Scale up planning and communication about the end of the current AAWAZ programme. Sustainability of achievements should be central to planning. Explore, model and build alliances with local government and statutory bodies for sustainability of AAWAZ Aagahi centres in particular. Support the Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) to develop their internal plans of continuous work with the communities.
- New proposed DFID programming in this area to sustain engagement in 45 districts (though this may require a different structure given limited resources), building on the human capital and social networks that we have invested in – on both the neglected thematic areas that AAWAZ has worked on (such as religious minorities) and emerging priorities (like modern slavery).

Deepen the change: inclusive development

- Ensure that learning from AAWAZ feeds directly into the new Consolidating Democracy in Pakistan programme (CDIP, which the same management organisation, DAI, manages).
- Continue to be ambitious in the long term about the role of women to perform the peace connector role in higher numbers, as well as in less formal conflict prevention roles.
- AAWAZ programme partners to support Aagahi Resource Centre resource persons to build a strong network and share learning on providing consistent, high quality support to their communities (including on disability). DAI also to encourage deeper and more regular sharing of lessons and learning with partners across the consortium, to build on consistency and quality of results for the final year, and maximise learnings to inform future programming.
- As the successor programme is developed, given limited resources, reflect on deepening engagement in specific priority communities like those that are conflict-affected. This could include the approach currently under discussion, by which district-level structures remain but village-level engagement is focused in the 22 most conflict-prone areas.

Build the evidence base and maximise learning: youth, modern slavery, violence and religious minorities

- Use monitoring and evaluation tools and best practice from the Strategic Learning Unit to deepen knowledge (qualitative and quantitative) of thematic areas/approaches that have arisen from the programme over the past five years. This particularly relates to youth, modern slavery and religious minorities, to inform the design of DFID's proposed successor programme.
- DFID to consider the value, in future programming, of supporting a small number of innovative grants, focused on thematic priorities (youth, religious minorities, modern slavery). For DAI, more detailed sharing of lessons from the AAWAZ grants would be positive – both within the programme and with DFID.
- Continue to maximise the sharing of information and lesson learning from the Gender Road Map pilot. Specifically, DAI to share learning with DFID's global, centrally managed £25 million research and innovation fund on violence against women and girls (What Works to Prevent

Violence). The programme is investing in a range of rigorously evaluated innovative grants to test which are the most effective and value-for-money interventions.

Capitalise on investment in young people

- AAWAZ partners to ensure 50/50 gender balance for youth leaders in the extension period.
- AAWAZ partners to analyse options for deepening work with youth leaders and youth circles of influence, including through digital tools and social media (WhatsApp, Instagram, Facebook) to improve rates of positive change in knowledge and in practical action. This should be combined with face-to-face meetings, including training and youth conventions to allow for networking and sharing of lessons learnt.

Deepen connections with other programmes and government

- Build on progress developing connections with line departments in more AAWAZ districts, to make Early Warning Systems more embedded.
- Build on discussions with DFID's Sub-National Governance Programme (Oxford Policy Management and Delivery Associates), to explore synergies and maximise on DFID's investment in supporting the people and government of both provinces to form inclusive budgets.
- DAI and DFID should explore different mechanisms to ensure communication with the district-level and provincial government of Punjab (GoPb), following good practice in KP, including updates through informal or formal DFID-GoPb discussion; joint field visits; a committee, or regular discussion between AAWAZ and the Planning & Development Department.

Strategic questions & efficiency

- DFID team to revise the impact weighting upwards (currently at 20%) to 25% for output 2 on prevention of violence, in light of the substantial and important work coming under this output, and the focus on religious minorities and conflict prevention outlined in the case made for a costed extension. We propose that output 4 is given a 15% impact weighting.
- DFID to transfer ownership of available assets to selected Community Based Organisations (CBOs) according to the disposition plan submitted by DAI in consultation with implementing partners.
- DAI and DFID to reflect on learning from the transition of the old contract to the contract extension period, to ensure orderly programme exit and transition to DFID's proposed future programming in this area.

Acronyms

| | |
|------|-------------------------------------|
| ADF | AAWAZ District Forum |
| AF | Aurat Foundation |
| APF | AAWAZ Provincial Forum |
| AR | Annual Review |
| ASC | AAWAZ Steering Committee |
| AUF | AAWAZ Union Council Forum |
| AVF | AAWAZ Village Forum |
| CBO | Community Based Organisation |
| CDIP | Consolidating Democracy in Pakistan |
| CNIC | Computerised National Identity Card |
| COP | Communities of Practice |
| CPO | Community Partner Organisation |
| CSO | Civil Society Organisation |
| DAI | Development Alternatives Inc. |
| DCC | District Coordination Committee |
| DCO | District Coordination Officer |
| ED | Executive Director |
| ERM | Early Response Mechanism |
| EWS | Early Warning System |
| FDI | Foreign Direct Investment |
| GBV | Gender Based Violence |
| GoPb | Government of Punjab |

| | |
|--------|--|
| IRR | Internal Rate of Return |
| JASAT | Jamhuriat Angan se Aiwan Tak (training) |
| KP | Khyber Pakhtunkhwa |
| LG | Local Government |
| MIS | Management Information System |
| MO | Management Organisation |
| MOU | Memorandum of Understanding |
| MPA | Member Provincial Assembly |
| NADRA | National Database and Registration Authority |
| NGO | Non-Government Organisation |
| PARR | Programme Analysis, Research and Results |
| PMC | Programme Management Committee |
| PRA | Participatory Rural Appraisal |
| RAG | Research Advisory Group |
| RTI | Right to Information |
| SAARC | South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation |
| SAP-PK | South Asia Partnership-Pakistan |
| SDC | Sustainable Development Conference |
| SDGs | Sustainable Development Goals |
| SLU | Strategic Learning Unit |
| SMT | Senior Management Team |
| SPO | Strengthening Participatory Organisation |
| UC | Union Council |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNFPA | United Nations Population Fund |
| USAID | United States Aid |
| VfM | Value for Money |
| VAWG | Violence Against Women and Girls |

A. Introduction and Context

| | |
|--|---|
| DevTracker Link to Business Case: | https://devtracker.dfid.gov.uk/projects/GB-1-114433/documents |
| DevTracker Link to Log frame: | https://devtracker.dfid.gov.uk/projects/GB-1-114433/documents |

Project Outline

The AAWAZ Voice and Accountability Programme is a six year, £37.2 million programme (May 2012 – May 2018, including the costed extension). It is one of the most far-reaching programmes in DFID Pakistan's portfolio, operating directly across 4,500 villages in 45 districts (26 in Punjab and 19 in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa). It works at the Union Council level, District level, Provincial level and national level. It is focused on reaching the poorest and most marginalised people: particularly women, religious minorities, young people, disabled people and transgendered people. AAWAZ is implemented through a consortium of Pakistani civil society partner organisations: South Asia Partnership (SAP-PK); the Aurat Foundation (AF); Strengthening Participatory Organisation (SPO); and Sungi Development Foundation, supported by Development Alternatives Inc. (DAI) as the management organisation.

AAWAZ's aim is to contribute to a stable, inclusive and tolerant democracy in Pakistan, framed around four outputs:

1. Women better able to participate safely in politics and in public spaces at federal, provincial and local levels in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) and Punjab (Pb).
2. Citizens and communities better able to resolve disputes peacefully, and work together for common solutions in KP and Punjab.
3. Women and other excluded groups better able to demand improved delivery of services in KP and Punjab.

4. Improved evidence generated, synthesised and communicated/championed to political leaders/elites in KP and Punjab.

Context

Pakistan is ranked second from last in the World Economic Forum's Gender Inequality Index 2016 (143 out of 144 countries). Discrimination against girls and women and other minorities is deeply embedded in Pakistan's social and cultural norms. The female literacy rate is just 48%. Only 3% of Pakistani women have bank accounts. The average monthly income of a female employee is five times less than that of men and 58% of female employees earn less than \$50 per month.

The larger context of different power relationships, including public and private patriarchy, male domination of government and political parties, and religious extremism, all affect the ability of women, religious minorities and other minority groups to participate meaningfully in decision making at different levels. The main structural barrier for women is designating home as the only natural and appropriate space and the public sphere as the appropriate domain for men.

The situation for religious and other minority groups is also precarious, with regular reports on inter-faith and sectarian violence.² Religious minorities also face identity-driven persecution and discrimination in the workplace. Good quality data on disability is unavailable in Pakistan at present, but anecdotal evidence supports global research indicating that disabled people are under-represented in political positions, more vulnerable to abuse and less likely to access essential services. Provision of basic services falls far short of international norms and people from minority groups, including women and girls, transgender people, religious minorities and disabled people, are being excluded from access to services.

B: PERFORMANCE AND CONCLUSIONS

Annual outcome assessment

The outcome: Democratic processes in Pakistan are more open, inclusive and accountable to citizens

The AAWAZ programme made significant progress in the last year to contribute to a more open, inclusive, and tolerant society in Pakistan, and in particular to making democratic processes more open, inclusive and accountable to citizens.

Significant numbers of citizens, particularly women, religious minorities and young people, were engaged and trained as leaders in their communities. Shifts in knowledge and attitudes were marked: for example, 98% of women AVF members are now aware of gender-based legislation and discriminatory practices (compared with 81% in 2016). 161,735 women voters were registered, and 1,228 women and 1,557 socially excluded men were supported to stand for positions in the local government elections.³

Knowledge, attitudes and behaviours have shifted: for example, since February 2016, the percentage of respondents who considered women's vote and candidature important increased by 7% (from 85% to 92%). 87% of women respondents across the 450 Union Councils stated that they had cast their vote in the last local government elections.

The programme built on the new approach to output 2, adopted last year, by driving further focus on prevention of conflict, rather than resolution. 198,118 citizens were trained in non-violent communication and valuing diversity. The Early Response Mechanisms (ERM) for dispute pre-emption are now in place in 100% of village forums and over 7 million people were positively affected by citizens' actions to protect communities from inter-faith, sectarian and gender-based violence.

² The South Asian Portal on Terrorism states that for 2016, there were at least 35 incidents of sectarian violence in Pakistan. The real number is likely to be much higher.

³ This data comes from AAWAZ Resource Persons who have directly supported women to register for CNICs and to vote; or women and social excluded men who have been directly supported to submit paperwork to stand in elections. DAI conduct a Data Quality Assessment to verify these findings.

Legislation that supports the rights of women and girls, religious minorities, and other excluded groups is an essential part of the enabling environment that underpins DFID's Strategic Vision for Women and Girls. The AAWAZ programme has made significant contribution to this work, too. The national and provincial forums contributed to the passing of three landmark pieces of legislation: the Anti-Honour Killing Law, the Anti-Rape Law and the Hindu Marriage Law.⁴ Interviews with implementing partners and AAWAZ Provincial Forums (APFs) demonstrated specific evidence of how lobbying work took place: direct drafting in some cases, and more indirect lobbying in others, either regarding the content of the Bill or by lobbying for support to get the Bills passed in the provincial or federal assembly.

In addition, many citizens who engage in the AAWAZ programme now feel able to raise demands to address gaps in service delivery, without fear of retribution or discrimination. At this point in the programme, over 13,000 meetings have been set up between citizens and district or provincial government officials (6,000 in the reporting year). This resulted in 9,544 citizen demands being met, including 3,032 demands on educational services and 2,552 on health. This year's annual survey assessed the change in the access and satisfaction of women and excluded groups with public sector services (health and education) in a sample of 16 districts selected from the programme areas (45 districts). The results show that 67% of the target communities were using public services (an 11% increase from the baseline) and 73% were satisfied with public services (a 7% increase from the baseline).

Overall output score and description

The programme has exceeded expectations this year, meeting or exceeding almost every target (41 out of 43). It deserves recognition for the scale of results achieved across the outputs, including two A++ output scorings for the work on preventing conflict and supporting citizens to demand better service delivery. Outputs 1 (on women's political empowerment) and 3 (on service delivery) were originally weighted at 30%, whilst output 2 (on prevention of violence) and output 4 (on monitoring and evaluation) were weighted at 20%. On a purely numerical basis, with present-day impact-weightings, this gives us a score that sits directly on the A+/A++ border, as the two A++ outcomes are weighted at 50%. Quite separate to the scoring decision, in recognition of the strategic importance and volume of the work under output 2, we propose that the weighting should be increased to 25%, with output 4 weighted at 15% - which takes place as soon as this Annual Review is published. This supported our judgement of giving the programme an A++ overall.

Priority lessons

Priority lessons from the reporting period are as follows:

- Learning from the AAWAZ programme demonstrates that to achieve transformative social change, investment over a long time period is critical, alongside working with effective partners with strong local links in targeted areas.
- Working with young people has enormous potential, and AAWAZ has been able to scale up quickly in this area. However, the costed extension period is critical for maximising on that investment: building on positive change in knowledge and innovative approaches to network-building will be a priority for the next year.
- The emphasis on inclusion, empowerment, and working with partners with strong local connections has allowed the programme to delve into highly sensitive issues in a risk adverse manner. Building on existing work in sensitive areas, particularly on religious minorities and modern slavery, will need to sustain that absolute commitment to our do no harm principle.

Priority actions

⁴ The anti-honour killing legislation introduces strict punishment for honour killings and removes the loophole whereby perpetrators could escape punishment by agreement with the victim's family. Under the new law relatives of the victim would only be able to intervene if the perpetrator is sentenced to capital punishment – in which case he would still face a mandatory sentence of twelve-and-a-half years. The new anti-rape law provides that the suspect may be subjected to medical examination and DNA testing and that cases must be resolved within three months. There is also new provision for anonymity of victims. For the first time in the history of Pakistan, the Hindu Marriage Act 2017 gives Hindus the right to marry by providing a mechanism and conditions for registration of Hindu marriage, and the grounds and procedure for dissolution of the marriage. It also provides the concept of judicial separation where the marriage remains intact but the parties are no longer co-habiting. Further, the legislation protects the rights of Hindu children by giving them a 'legitimate' status.

A full summary of all recommendations arising from this assessment are detailed on page 2. The four priority actions from this list are as follows:

1. Scale up planning and communication about the end of the current AAWAZ programme, with **sustainability of achievements** central to planning. Explore, model and build alliances with local government and statutory bodies for sustainability of AAWAZ Aagahi centres. Support the CSOs to develop their internal plans of continuous work with the communities;
2. Use monitoring and evaluation tools and best practice from the Strategic Learning Unit to deepen knowledge (qualitative and quantitative) of thematic areas/approaches that have risen from the programme over the past five years: particularly relating to **youth, modern slavery and religious minorities to feed in to the design of DFID's proposed successor programme;**
3. DAI to analyse options for **deepening work with youth leaders** and youth circles of influence, including maximising on digital tools and social media (WhatsApp, Instagram, Facebook) to improve rates of positive action to support tolerance and prevent modern slavery;
4. DFID team to revise the impact weighting upwards (currently at 20%) to 25%, in light of the substantial and important work coming under this output, and the **focus on religious minorities and conflict prevention outlined in the case made for a costed extension.**

Has the logframe been updated since the last review?

Yes, in December 2016.

C: DETAILED OUTPUT SCORING

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|---|---|-----------|
| Output Title | Women better able to participate safely in politics and in public spaces at federal, provincial and local levels in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab | | |
| Output number per LF | 1 | Output Score | A+ |
| Risk: | Moderate | Impact weighting (%): | 30% |
| Risk revised since last AR? | N | Impact weighting % revised since last AR? | No |

Over the reporting period, the programme was expected to increase women's ability to safely participate in political life at multiple levels. The AAWAZ programme has outperformed its milestone targets across almost every indicator for this output (17 out of 19, with 2 indicators missed by small margins). For example, 418 youth circles of influence were established across 45 districts, when the milestone target for this period was 240. AAWAZ has achieved an A+ overall for this output, based on exceeding the set targets significantly overall.

Specific details of progress against each milestone are outlined in the table below. A summary of main points and a qualitative assessment, drawing on our field visits, follows.

| Indicator(s) | Milestones | Progress |
|--|--|--|
| 1.1.a Number of women and girls participating in awareness raising sessions and change agent training on participation in public spaces and political processes and women's right to freedom from violence and receiving change agent training | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 55 women master trainers trained on additional modules 80,000 women and girls (90% of the total women AVF members) made aware on pro-women laws, early marriage, customary practices, women's rights and political participation 75% women in AVFs demonstrate positive change in knowledge (pre/post evaluation) 7,000 women trained as change makers and at least 75% of them are able to establish circles of influence in AVFs where 3 out of 4 issues (gender, discriminatory practices, exclusion and right to information) are discussed and regular follow-up is maintained | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 104 women master trainers (37 in KP) trained through four partners 98,635 women and girls (38,995 KP and 59,640 Punjab) made aware of pro-women laws, early marriage, customary practices, women's rights and political participation through awareness raising sessions 90% women in AVFs demonstrate positive change in knowledge (pre/post evaluation) 8,652 women trained as master trainer/change agents. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 92% of change agents have established circle of influence and sharing information with an estimated 83 (29 AVF members, 54 non-AVF members) women in a village on all four themes: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Around 84% of women have better understanding about gender and gender roles and issues of social cohesion More than 98% women are now aware of |

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| | | <p>gender-based legislation and discriminatory practices</p> <p>c. 71% of women know about social cohesion</p> <p>d. Around 62% of women know about social accountability mechanisms, for example, the right to information act and mohtasib⁵</p> |
| <p>1.1.b Cadre of women in AVFs demonstrating:</p> <p>a. Knowledge of basic human and women's rights</p> <p>b. Confidence of participation in public meetings and AAWAZ initiatives</p> <p>c. Communication skills: listen and value women with attention and compassion and without judgment, advice or interruptions</p> <p>d. Confidence in decision making and their follow up</p> <p>e. Negotiating, influencing and relationship skills</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 66% sample size with at least 4/5 skills | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 81% sample size with 4/5 skills: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Knowledge of basic human and women's rights b. Confidence of participation in public meetings and AAWAZ initiatives c. Communication skills: listen and value women with attention and compassion and without judgment, advice or interruptions. d. Relationship skills • More than 96% of women are aware of their rights • Decision making skills need further support • 45% of women respondents possess all five skills |
| <p>1.2.a Number of men and boys participating in awareness raising sessions and change agent training on the role of male socialisation and receiving change agent training</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 55 men master trainers trained on additional modules • 84,000 men and boys (90% of the total men forum members) made aware of pro-women laws, early marriages, customary practices and women rights of political participation • 8,000 men trained as change agents and at least 50% of them are able to establish circle of influence in AVFs where 3 out of 4 issues are discussed and regular follow-up is maintained | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 97 men master trainers (34 KP, 63 Punjab) trained through four partners • 99,347 men and boys (41,899 KP, 57,448 Punjab) made aware through training of women's rights, Violence Against Women/Girls (VAWG), masculinity and gender-based legislation. 86% men in AVFs demonstrate positive change in knowledge (pre/post evaluation) • 8,122 men trained as master trainers/change agents. |
| <p>1.2.b Number of men and</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 66% sample size with at | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Around 79% of men |

⁵ Complaints system through official ombudsman.

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| <p>boys who are in AVFs demonstrating:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Knowledge on the role of male socialisation, masculinity, power, privilege and control as root causes of gender inequality Communication skills – to listen to girls and women with attention and compassion, and without judgment, advice or interruptions Improved relationship skills - involving girls and women in decision making | <p>least 2/3 skills</p> | <p>possess 2/3 skills:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Knowledge Communication skills <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 67% of men possess all 3 skills: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Knowledge Communication skills Improved relationship skills |
| <p>1.3 Number of women actively participating in AVFs and public events and in leadership positions</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 75,000 women actively participating in forum meetings 15,000 actively participating in women assemblies/khuli katcheries⁶ 21,000 women in leadership positions and 66% of them demonstrating at least 3/5 skills: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Knowledge of women rights and legislative entitlement Communication, influencing and relationship skills Play effective role in campaigning/contesting for Local Government bodies election and/or women assemblies Possess budget literacy and carrying out advocacy at local level. Take initiatives to voice and address VAW/G in their communities | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 78,908 women (80% of total women forum members) actively participated in forum meetings. Around 74,594 women actively participated in women assemblies/khuli katcheries and youth conventions 24,489 women have assumed leadership roles, comprising 10,370 office bearers, 429 resource persons, 1,403 women assembly members, 8,652 change agents and 3,635 women in sub-committees. Over 83% of them demonstrating 4/5 skills including: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 95% are aware of women's rights and pro-women legislation; 75% of women leaders are confident to contest elections and almost all of them have demonstrated support to local community women in their CNIC and voter registration; |

⁶ A khuli katchery is an open house meeting that provides an opportunity for the local community, women in particular, to engage with state functionaries like ministers, bureaucrats, local government representatives and government officials from line departments. They listen to the public's problems and complaints and find solutions for urgent relief to the applicants.

| | | |
|---|--|---|
| | | <p>c. 81% have undertaken advocacy actions; and</p> <p>d. 80% have proactively taken initiatives on VAWG.</p> |
| <p>1.4 Number of women receiving CNICs, registered as voters and supported to file nomination papers in the local government elections supported by AAWAZ</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 85-90% women receive CNIC • 75-80% women voters registered • 70% of the target community sensitized and motivated to participate in Local Government as voters • 500 women and 100 excluded group members emerged as candidates for local government elections | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 83% women (189,245 women) receive CNIC • 77% women (161,735 women) voters registered • 85% of the target community sensitized and motivated to participate in Local Government as voters • 1,228 women (700 KP, 528 Punjab) and 1,557 socially excluded men (1,006 KP, 551 Punjab) supported to stand in local government elections. • 628 women (442 KP, 186 Punjab) candidates and 884 excluded men (624 KP, 260 Punjab) members won these elections |
| <p>1.5 Number of youth leaders with improved skills and supported to challenge discriminatory social norms in AAWAZ communities</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 240 youth circles of influence established in 24 districts • 4,800 youth leaders (50% men and 50% women) trained on four themes and 75% of them demonstrate positive change in knowledge (pre/post evaluation) • At least 50% of the youth leaders taking affirmative actions to further support youth within their constituencies | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 418 youth circles of influence established across 45 districts • 8,856 youth leaders (3,321 girls, 5,533 boys, two transgender) trained on four themes • 73% of youth leaders demonstrate 37% improvement in their knowledge (pre/post evaluation) • All youth leaders have developed action plans and have held detailed sessions with community on non-violent communication and gender concepts. In consequence, 87% of community respondents were more knowledgeable and 47% of them claimed to have taken actions against VAWG • 71% youth leaders reported that they have taken steps to eliminate violence against women. 57% shared that they took initiatives to spread the message on non-violent communication. 43% youth leaders also took steps to |

Main Points

AAWAZ made significant progress across many indicators for this output. The detail is captured in the table outlining figures against every target. The main reflections from the data in the table, the annual report, and the field visits we conducted are as follows:

Empowerment and leadership

This year, the '*Jamhoriyat Angan Se Aiwan Tak*' (JASAT)⁷ training reached over 43,000 women and men, bringing the cumulative total to almost 200,000 people, with significant shifts in knowledge and attitudes. As one example, 98% of women forum members are now aware of gender-based legislation and discriminatory practices, compared with 81% for the previous year.

Active participation in the informal political sphere is critical: nearly 25,000 AAWAZ women now hold leadership positions. These include roles as office bearers in AVFs, membership of the Women Assemblies, change makers, Aagahi Centre resource persons, and sub-committee members. These women are not only actively involved in decision making, giving them increased voice, choice and control over their lives: they are also supporting others to gain confidence and rights through their work, and acting as role models in their communities.

The AAWAZ Programme also tested a new approach to tackle power dynamics at the household level, with the 'Gender Road Map' approach. This aims to improve marital relationships, reduce domestic violence and create a safe environment for respectful communication between couples. It focused on a small sample of 119 couples, with the aim of raising awareness of gender roles in an intensive way and promoting healthy and equal relationships.

The depth of change in knowledge and attitudes

The depth of change in knowledge and attitudes that has been realised in the reporting period, after five years of investment, is remarkable in some places.

99,347 men and boys (41,899 in KP, and 57,338 in Punjab) have been trained on women's rights, violence against women and girls, masculinity and gender-based legislation. 86% of men in AVFs demonstrate a positive change in knowledge.

Three years ago, women and girls in the villages where the Annual Review team conducted focus group discussions did not feel able (and/or were not allowed) to leave the house without a male chaperone. There was significant stigma in some locations associated with women claiming their legal right to inheritance. Anecdotal evidence suggests that the depth of social change was in some places remarkable: from the AVF in a renowned conservative area in South Punjab, where the men talked seriously about the importance of women having social space and freedom from emotional violence, to the village in Haripur where women's social (as well as legal) right to inheritance was now being supported by some high-status men.

Citizen power and programme maturity

Under this output, a main objective was to support socially excluded citizens to engage with informal and formal political structures, without fear of discrimination or retribution. In this past year, the AAWAZ programme has outstripped expectations by thousands of people or over double the target (for example achieving 2.45 times the target for women candidates; or 1.74 times the target for youth circles), as the investment over time starts to pay real dividends. Tracing the performance of the programme over the past five years demonstrates the exponential potential of voice and accountability work to deliver over time and indicates how valuable programmes with a long-term timeframe (i.e. beyond three years) are for achieving DFID's objectives in this area. It also supports the case to develop a successor programme that can maximise further on this engagement.

⁷ "Democracy - From Home to Parliament".

For example, against a target of 15,000 people actively participating in Women Assemblies and/or khuli katcheries, 74,594 women actively participated in these meetings, or youth conventions. Nearly 25,000 women have assumed leadership roles, including 1,228 women (700 in KP and 528 in Punjab) and 1,557 socially excluded men⁸ being supported to stand for positions in the local government elections. 628 women candidates and 884 men won these elections. In another village in South Punjab where we conducted focus group discussions, a woman had run against a man from an elite family, the male member of which had, in living memory, always held the political position. Contesting the election in itself was ground-breaking: that she only lost by a mere 15 votes is also telling of the change that has taken place. Elite capture of AAWAZ empowerment projects in these communities is a risk, but one that is mitigated by the strong facilitation by CSO partners in most contexts.

In addition to those supported to run for positions, 85% of the target community were sensitised and supported to participate in Local Government as voters.⁹ The AAWAZ programme met their target on women voters registered (77% or 161,735 women voters registered), and almost reached the target on CNIC registration. 83% of women received their CNIC (target of 85-90%). This equates to an additional 20,127 women obtaining their CNICs and 10,165 registered to vote this year. Barriers to reaching the CNIC target included the accessibility of some Aagahi Centres and the requirement for strong partnerships with the relevant government departments to resolve some cases – this is addressed in the recommendations.

The Women Assemblies were a new initiative this year, established in 45 districts as a tool to support and train potential women leaders, and make structures to support follow ups on the advocacy action plans of respective districts. AAWAZ build the leadership skills of 1,564 Women Assembly members. The assessment of this initiative demonstrated some compelling results: 75% of the women leaders now feel confident to contest an election (from a 67% baseline), and more than 80% had proactively taken initiatives on VAWG.

In addition to this district level investment in women's empowerment and leadership, the AAWAZ programme built on the work of last year with the regional network established in 2016, called the South Asian Women Alliance (SAWA). In January 2017, AAWAZ organised the Regional Conference for South Asian Women Alliance of Community Leaders, with participation from eight countries from SAARC (South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation) countries. A critical outcome from this was the agreement to register with the SAARC Secretariat in Nepal as an alliance that can receive funds, and the successful lobbying of the Secretariat to establish an SDG desk.

Social investment: Youth Leaders

The programme surpassed expectations by establishing 418 youth circles of influence, across 45 districts (as referenced above). During the reporting year, AAWAZ held 138 youth conventions with 5,187 boys and 1,000 girls. The youth circles of influence included 5,533 boys, 1,000 girls, and 2 transgender people, at Union Council and district levels. AAWAZ conducted intensive, participative training with 8,856 youth leads on gender and masculinity, VAWG, violent extremism and alternative discourse and non-violent communication. All youth leaders took pledges of zero tolerance to any form of VAWG and extremism in their societies. They then developed action plans and detailed discussion sessions with their circles of influence. 71% of youth leaders reported that they have taken steps to eliminate violence against women and girls. As one youth leader from Sargodha said: "I got so deeply influenced by the messages delivered in the youth circle session. As a result, I was able to stop an early child marriage of a girl in my village. I understand that I am playing a role of first raindrop within my community to stop early child marriages and other anti-women practices."

73% of youth leaders demonstrated a 37% improvement in their knowledge. This fell short of the target of a positive change in knowledge for 75% of them – although the AAWAZ programme trained many more youth leaders than expected (8856 rather than 4800), so in absolute numbers they were close to their target. This is addressed in the recommendations section.

Recommendations

⁸ For example, religious minorities or disabled men.

⁹ 85% out of 2176 households spread over 16 districts in the monitoring and evaluation survey.

- Scale up planning and communication about the end of the current AAWAZ programme - sustainability of achievements should be central to planning. Explore, model and build alliances with local government and statutory bodies for sustainability of AAWAZ Aagahi centres in particular. Support the CSOs to develop their internal plans of continuous work with the communities;
- New proposed DFID programming in this area to sustain engagement in 45 districts (though this may require a different structure given limited resources), building on the human capital and social networks that we have invested in – on both the neglected thematic areas that AAWAZ has worked on (such as religious minorities) and emerging priorities (like modern slavery);
- Ensure that learning from AAWAZ feeds directly into the new Consolidating Democracy in Pakistan programme (which DAI will manage);
- AAWAZ partners to ensure 50/50 gender balance for youth leaders in the extension period;
- AAWAZ partners to analyse options for deepening work with youth leaders and youth circles of influence, including maximising on digital tools and social media (WhatsApp, Instagram, Facebook) to improve rates of positive change in knowledge and in practical action. This should be combined with face-to-face meetings, including training and youth conventions to allow for networking and sharing of lessons learnt.

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|--|---|------------|
| Output Title | Citizens and communities better able to resolve disputes peacefully, and work together for common solutions in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab | | |
| Output number per LF | 2 | Output Score | A++ |
| Risk: | Moderate | Impact weighting (%): | 20% |
| Risk revised since last AR? | N | Impact weighting % revised since last AR? | No |

Output 2 was changed after the 2015 Annual Review to focus on addressing conflict prevention at the community level, instead of trying to bring about conflict resolution. The output is designed to use specific training (around conflict prevention; community-based mobilisation; Early Response Mechanisms and inclusive peace-building initiatives) to *prevent* rather than assuage conflict at the community level. The Early Response Mechanisms are supported by peace connectors who developed a 'district peace map', to analyse hotspots and potential triggers. Peace connectors meet each other regularly and developed a communication channel amongst themselves and relevant members of the authorities to escalate tensions before conflict takes place (such a telephone directories and WhatsApp groups).

Building on the successes in output 1, progress made against output 2 is significant, and exceeds expectations across every indicator, often by substantial margins. The scoring of A++ reflects this set of results. Details are outlined in the logframe table below against each milestone targets, and main thematic points are drawn out.

| Indicator(s) | Milestones | Progress |
|--|---|--|
| 2.1 Number of women and men informed about support mechanisms and provided with awareness on non-violent communication and valuing diversity | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 5 key messages developed and shared on non-violence and tolerance (continually reinforced) • 150,000 citizens (50% women) made aware about non-violent communication and valuing diversity • 75% men and women in AVFs demonstrate positive change in knowledge (pre/post evaluation) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 5 key messages developed and shared on non-violence and tolerance. • 198,118 citizens (80,926 KP, 117,192 Punjab) citizens aware of non-violent communication and diversity through awareness raising sessions. • 76% men and women demonstrate knowledge and understanding of non-violent communication |
| 2.2.a Number of women, men | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 5 million people in 45 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 7.099 million (2.25 KP, |

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| <p>and socially excluded citizens positively affected by AAWAZ forum actions/ members' actions to protect them from discrimination and harmful practices</p> | <p>districts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Early Response Mechanism for dispute pre-emption in place in at least 90% of AVFs • Early Warning System in place for at least 20 out of 22 districts | <p>4.849 Punjab) people positively affected. Details are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 2.90 million (0.49 KP, 2.41 Punjab) people positively affected in 21 conflict sensitive districts and 4.199 million people (1.761 KP, 2.438 Punjab) positively affected by the pre-emption of 22,035 conflicts at village level • Early Response Mechanism in place in 100% of AVFs. VAWG existed in almost every village, while 60% of them had sectarian and inter-faith conflicts • All AVFs used Participatory Rural Appraisal tools (98% problem tree, 89% power analyses) in their conflict analyses. • Early Warning System in place for at least 21 out of 22 districts (7 KP, 14 Punjab) • 100% ADFs have developed peace maps in a multi-stakeholder workshop in their districts. • VAWG existed in all union councils of each district, while 34% had sectarian and 15% had interfaith conflicts. |
| <p>2.2.b % of people in programme districts who consider community pre-emption and cohesion mechanisms to be credible and effective</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 80% | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Based on the Annual Follow-on Survey 2017, 95% of the village respondents who are aware of the conflict pre-emption mechanisms in their respective areas, considered these mechanisms credible and effective. |
| <p>2.3 Number of women and excluded group members participating in AVFs' local level peace building initiatives</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 120,000 women and excluded groups participating in events and 66% reporting (post event feedback) significant | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 294,403 (155,733 women, 138,630 men minority members, 40 transgender people), (83,501 KP, 210,902 Punjab) |

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| | improvement in social cohesion knowledge and attitude | participated in events <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. 66% respondents rated their experience of participation in these events as strongly valuable b. 76% respondents are aware of peace related laws and non-violent communication approaches c. 94% respondents think that religious minorities in Pakistan should celebrate their days / events with liberty and d. 64% of them reported claimed participation in the social events of minorities. |
|--|---|--|

Main Points

The preventative approach

Last year, AAWAZ adopted a new approach to output 2, focused on prevention rather than resolution of conflict, inter-faith / sectarian, land disputes, gender-based violence and community conflict. This year, the approach was built upon, with 198,118 citizens trained in non-violent communication and valuing diversity, and 76% of men and women demonstrating positive change in knowledge on these issues. Cumulatively across the lifespan of the programme, 7.099 million people were positively affected by AAWAZ forum/individual AAWAZ forum members' actions to protect communities from discrimination, harmful cultural practices, and violence (whether sectarian, inter-faith or gender based).

Up to 120,000 women and men were trained on citizenship; the positive values of compassion; human rights and mutual respect; the need for quality services; identification of the causes of conflict; and how to draw upon existing community structures to build consensus for peace in the area. The participants were particularly sensitised about hate speech and other triggers of conflict, and the direct links between hate speech and harmful impacts on marginalised groups. The work with young people in this output has strong potential, including the use of formal places of learning (schools, college and universities) to spread awareness of priority messages, as long as risks are mitigated.

Our field visits revealed encouraging use of the AAWAZ Village Forum networks to prevent violence between different communities, as well as internally within communities. For example, in Layya, a Muslim-dominated village sits in close proximity to a Christian-dominated village. News of a planned inter-faith marriage was causing rumours of violence and the AVFs from both communities came together to have a constructive conversation on how to avoid such a conflict. The result was discussion of the different options with the man and woman who were planning to marry. The conflict was prevented as a result of these discussions, with the man and woman deciding not to marry in the end. This example reveals some of the depth to the challenges and risks of conflict prevention in this context, where addressing the triggers of violence rather than the root causes is at times the only safe, feasible option in the short term. This does not undermine the significance of the progress achieved in bringing communities of different faiths and sects together to resolve points of contention.

Prevalence and learning

Out of three categories of conflict focused on in output 2, violence against women and girls was by far the most prevalent. Data suggests that it exists in almost every village, whilst 60% of villages have

sectarian and inter-faith conflicts. This level of violence and conflict is intolerable and a major barrier to the development of individuals, communities and societies. It is important that out of the 294,403 people who participated in peace-building events, 157,243 were women, and 139,670 were men from minority groups. However it is worth noting that of the total peace connectors, 5,752 are men and 3,455 are women. The programme should build on success to support more women further, to participate effectively in formal conflict resolution mechanisms. This should be done with recognition of the need for conflict resolution to be led by people with status at the community level, but also the evidence around women's engagement in lasting peace settlements.

Learning from the programme suggests that at a community-level, inter-faith and sectarian conflict is often triggered by issues relating to music, public processions, the timing of religious rituals or driven by personal grievances. One example is of a case in Peshawar, where a Christian community used to pray and play church music on a Friday, which escalated tensions between the Christian community and nearby mosques. To prevent the issue from escalating further, the Early Warning System members of the AAWAZ District Forum met both parties of the Christians and Muslim community to come to an agreement. As a result, the Christian community agreed to finish church music before the commencement of Juma Prayers in the mosques. The Muslim community committed to being tolerant of the Christian communities' religious activities. Similar examples were also given of resolving tensions around timings of calls to prayer or processions for different sects of Islam.

The Early Response Mechanisms for dispute pre-emption are now in place in 100% of AVFs, and peace connectors are critical as a part of this mechanism. They develop and maintain monthly action plans and a list of focal points for managing conflicts, if and when they arise. This year they were engaged in peer learning exercises at the Union Council level, gaining a deeper understanding about conflicts and the different aspects which contribute to the pre-emption of a conflict. The peace connectors then shared their feedback for the Early Warning System Matrix and individual District Peace action plans. This opportunity for peace connectors of different councils to connect with and learn from each other is promising (including work using digital tools like WhatsApp). The opportunities for youth leaders to connect via social media and other digital tools could also have potential value here. The development of connections with government line departments was also important progress (including one district being included in Rescue 1122 groups to deal with emergencies). The level of satisfaction with the EWS (96% of respondents) demonstrates the value and trust placed in them.

Recommendations

- DFID team to revise the impact weighting upwards (currently at 20%) to 25%, in light of the substantial and important work coming under this output, and the focus on religious minorities and conflict prevention outlined in the case made for a costed extension. We propose that output 4 is given a 15% impact weighting;
- Continue to prioritise the do no harm principle in risk management. Specifically, give particular training to youth leaders on managing risks around speaking out for tolerant and inclusive societies as their role grows, particularly for religious minorities in formal educational settings and informal settings alike;
- Build on progress developing connections with line departments in more AAWAZ districts, to make Early Warning Systems more embedded;
- As the successor programme is developed, given limited resources, reflect on deepening engagement in specific priority communities like those that are conflict-affected. This could include the approach currently under discussion, by which district-level structures remain but village-level engagement is focused in the 22 most conflict-prone areas.

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|--|---|------------|
| Output Title | Women and other excluded groups better able to demand improved delivery of services in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab | | |
| Output number per LF | 3 | Output Score | A++ |
| Risk: | Moderate | Impact weighting (%): | 30% |
| Risk revised since last AR? | N | Impact weighting % revised since last AR? | No |

This output is designed to ensure that women and marginalised groups have better access to services and stronger voices in demanding them. It equips communities with the tools needed to demand better services, and it provides government with local knowledge about the gaps in service delivery (including corruption) and the needs and priorities of its citizens. programme outstripped the milestone targets for every indicator, again on some indicators by a significant margin. This has resulted in an output score of A++. More details are outlined in the table below for each indicator, followed by a summary of the main themes that emerged from this assessment.

| Indicator(s) | Milestones | Progress |
|--|---|--|
| 3.1 Number of women and socially excluded citizens informed of rights, procedures and hotlines for accessing and demanding improved delivery of services from public officials and political representatives | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Information packages developed and shared (continually reinforced) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. 450 functional AAWAZ Aagahi Centres b. 80,000 females accessing AAWAZ Aagahi Centres (Continued) c. 2.5 million citizens informed through electronic media | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 198,118 citizens informed on the basics of citizenship, advocacy for social services, Right to Information and procedures to access public services. • 450 AAWAZ Aagahi Centres (AAC) 190 KP, 260 Punjab actively used to connect citizens to state services and information • The coverage of each AAC has increased from six to eight villages since last year • 49% respondents reported that they visit centres for social space with women, while the remaining respondents used these centres for information sharing and improved access to services. • Over 80,000 women and girls accessed AAC in this year • AAWAZ reached an estimated 5.978 million people by the use of print and electronic media, telephone contacts and face-to-face interactions |
| 3.2 Number and types of demands raised with public officials and political representatives in education, health and other priority areas benefiting women, girls and other excluded groups | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 20,000 demands raised • 8,000 engagements with district and provincial government duty-bearers on policy or implementation issues impacting improved service delivery • Early Warning System in place for at least 20 out of | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21,662 demands raised Over 13,000 engagements were made in 209 District Coordination Committees meetings, 1,877 <i>khuli katcheries</i> and 11,160 one-on-one meetings between citizens, including women members with district and provincial government officials on policy or implementation issues • Early Warning System in |

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| | 22 districts | <p>place for at least 21 out of 22 districts (7 KP, 14 Punjab)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The District Coordination Committees (DCCs) established in 19 districts of KP • The government of Punjab sent notification to all 26 districts for support and coordination |
| 3.3.a Number of households impacted by improved service delivery | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 600,000 households benefitted | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 867,896 households benefitted equivalent to 6.07 million people. • 12,366 demands met including 4,199 education; 3,342 health; and 4,825 other issues. |
| 3.3.b Cumulative number of demonstrable changes in policy and implementation by local/provincial government in response to public demands where there is attribution to AAWAZ, a proportion of which reflect the voice of women and other socially excluded groups | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • At least 20 examples from across the programme | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 36 relevant examples from across the programme exhibiting demonstrable change in policy and implementation |

Main Points

AAWAZ's reach at multiple levels

This year, AAWAZ held sessions for over 120,000 women and men on the basics of citizenship; advocacy for social services; the right to information; and information on procedures to access public services. Thousands of individual citizens and groups have been supported to set up direct contact with public officials through different mediums (including 6,000 instances in this year alone). In addition, some ADFs started the process of engaging with the relevant government stakeholders for pre-budget consultation and expenditure tracking and monitoring. ADFs undertook an analysis of the budget allocations in education, health and other social services based on disparity of gender, social exclusion and geography. The participants made demands for the budget allocation for excluded groups, including increased funds for religious minorities and women's development. Representatives from local government assured the relevant AVFs, AUFs and ADF that public consultation will now be taken before budget allocations. This type of analysis is particularly important as the process of devolvement in both provinces gathers momentum, and will have additional value when new data about the demographics of different areas is made public following the census.

Output 3 has retained the focus on minorities

A strength of the programme is its commitment to leaving no one behind across every output - empowerment for all excluded groups, not just women; prevention of conflict with gender at its heart; and in output 3, a focus on breaking the traditional patron/client relationship to allow citizens, including those traditionally discriminated against, to demand basic services. 9,544 demands were met, including 3,032 demands around education and 2,552 on health. An example of the inclusive nature of the work is in Haripur, KP, where AAWAZ provided support to disabled people to demand their rights from the government of KP. The programme supported participation in a peaceful protest, after which the administration arranged an in-house meeting with members of the AAWAZ forum and senior representatives from government. The government functionaries agreed to all 5 of the demands

(including, for example, provision of free medical aid to disabled people and an increase in the quota for government jobs for disabled people).¹⁰

One success of the Aagahi Centres is that they have evolved from women friendly spaces to a citizen advice bureau function in many places, and there are lessons to learn from this. For example, there is an opportunity to build on knowledge about what financial support disabled people are entitled to, and what the process is to access that entitlement. The programme may be able to deliver more for disabled people with additional emphasis on trainings and through peer-learning in this area, and to feed lessons into the design of DFID's new programming.

Another positive to the power of voice: value for money

The value for money case under this output is particularly striking, when you compare the costs of building an additional health unit from scratch, with the cost of funding a khuli katcheri in which citizens demand a missing health unit be built, and the government then responds to the demand. To give a costed example, in the case of Bhola village drainage, the government allocated a budget of £70,707 to clean the drain for 10km of the affected area. The UK's contribution was £134 to set up the khuli katcheri. More details of the value for money case are addressed in the dedicated section below.

Recommendations:

- Build on discussion with DFID's Sub-National Governance Programme , to explore synergies and maximise on DFID's investment in supporting the people and government of both provinces to form inclusive budgets;
- AAWAZ programme partners to support Aagahi Resource Centre resource persons to build a strong network and share learning on providing consistent, high quality support to their communities (including disability). DAI also to encourage deeper and more regular sharing of lessons and learning with partners across the consortium, to improve delivery for the final year, and maximise learning to inform future programming.

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|--|---|-----------|
| Output Title | Improved evidence generated, synthesized and communicated/ championed to political leadership in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab | | |
| Output number per LF | 4 | Output Score | A+ |
| Risk: | Minor | Impact weighting (%): | 20% |
| Risk revised since last AR? | N | Impact weighting % revised since last AR? | No |

Output 4 is a foundation for the work across outputs 1 to 3. It makes quality monitoring and evaluation systems a central yardstick for success; aims to ensure that research and innovation underpins and supports policy and practice; and supports specific advocacy campaigns on priority AAWAZ themes.

The AAWAZ programme has made significant progress in developing monitoring and evaluation systems – particularly the decision to implement data quality assessments across all 45 districts, which have increased confidence in the data being provided. Against the milestone targets, the programme consistently hit its targets, and in some cases exceeded expectations, for example by reaching many more people through advocacy campaigns. Overall, this output therefore scored an A+.

| Indicator(s) | Milestones | Progress |
|---|---|---|
| 4.1 Effective evidence-based (qualitative/quantitative) monitoring and evaluation systems established | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A fully functional monitoring and evaluation system in place for the managing agent and partner organizations | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Log frame revised and approved by DFID. monitoring and evaluation plan developed, approved and being implemented. • 10 quantitative and qualitative assessments completed on a quarterly |

¹⁰ The government of KP has employed 17 disabled people within the bureaucracy since this agreement.

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> MIS system used to produce final analyses of results | <p>basis.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Data quality assessment (DQA) carried out across 45 districts MIS system developed and used by all programme and district staff across all 45 districts for data analyses Two additional monitoring and evaluation working groups established |
| 4.2 Number of quality evidence based research commissioned on select thematic issues and shared for policy and practice | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 15 research studies commissioned 8 evidence informed policy briefs for AAWAZ initiatives produced and used by CSO network and research organizations. 19 Response Fund innovative projects launched 30% of innovations funded by AAWAZ receive subsequent scale up funding (by AAWAZ or others) Knowledge base institutionalized for information sharing between partners | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 19 studies completed and published. 8 policy briefs completed and used by CSO networks. 29 projects implemented and completed under the Response Fund in four phases. 33% i.e. 7 partners received scale-up funding. Four of them got it from AAWAZ and five from other sources. Knowledge management strategy and plan developed and implemented to raise profile of knowledge products through seminars, lobbying meetings and media actions for advocacy |
| 4.3.a Cumulative number and types of quality advocacy campaigns started by AAWAZ, consolidated, synthesized and analysed by PARR (Policy, Analysis, Results and Research Unit) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3 campaigns continued 3 million people reached on key issues like VAWG, hate speech and improved local governance | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3 Campaigns (EVAW/G, anti-hate speech and local government) implemented. 9,171,782 people reached on women rights through PTV, radio and social media. Policy Advocacy Action Plan prepared and monitored |
| 4.3.b Number of women and men who are in AVFs demonstrating knowledge on AAWAZ's research and communication products and campaign themes Cumulative number of adaptations in implementation and policy, and demonstration of good practice attributable to AAWAZ products | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 70% sample size aware of at least 7/15 studies on select themes At least 10 examples from across the programme | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 76% of the 687 total respondents across 39 districts are aware of the 7/15 research studies 10 response fund projects demonstrating change in implementation at policy level |

Main Points

Innovation and knowledge: modern slavery, youth and minorities

Beyond the Data Quality Assessments referenced above, a highlight of the monitoring and evaluation work was the completion of ten qualitative assessments across 45 districts in Punjab and KP. Three new assessments were included, focused on the effectiveness of youth leaders, non-violent communication and outreach of research briefs. These assessments could be expanded to include further qualitative work on areas like modern slavery (particularly bonded labour and child labour) which have been

identified as issues in almost every AAWAZ District. Focus-group discussions for this review revealed the need for deeper understanding of bonded and child labour: its prevalence, the impact on communities, and the power structures that may prevent discussion or change. The evidence generated so far, and in the costed extension period, will feed into the thinking for DFID's proposed new programme.

Using monitoring and evaluation, learning and research: adaptation, course correction & synergies

The structures set up by the monitoring and evaluation team have supported adaptation and course correction using findings from the qualitative assessments. The findings were shared with the programme and district staff during the quarterly review meetings for follow-up and course correction as required.

Research papers and policy briefs published by AAWAZ's Strategic Learning Unit this year were as follows:

- Radicalisation and engendered space;
- Hindus in South Punjab: A study on the nature of discrimination;
- Local government in KP and Punjab: framework, current status and challenges;
- Practice, profess and propagate: Article 20 of the Constitution of Pakistan;
- Service delivery in public policy;
- Qualified equality – forms of discrimination;
- Measuring voice, determining accountability in selected districts of Pakistan: a proof of method;
- Key facts on the transgender community in Pakistan;
- Women and excluded groups in political parties;
- An analysis of parliamentary questions;
- Effectiveness of public messaging.

Feedback from assessments carried out in 39 districts on the effectiveness of the Strategic Learning Unit's research showed very positive results. 76% of respondents were aware of 7/15 research studies and considered them useful. These products have generated discussion on thematic issues among community members, raised awareness, and supported campaigns.

The recent development of a working group to share learning and build synergies across DAI programmes in DFID Pakistan is a very positive one. There are some clear links between existing programmes with which DFID and DAI work in partnership (AAWAZ and Alif Ailaan, a programme focused on campaigning for change on education) and the new programme (Consolidating Democracy in Pakistan). This should be built on, to reach out to other partners managing programmes with similar potential for synergies and sharing learning (for example the Sub-National Governance programme mentioned above, and the Building Disaster Resilience Programme which works in some of the same districts at present).

The response fund

The response fund provides small grants to organisations working on AAWAZ themes, and was designed to encourage innovation, address issues as they arose in the programme, and create evidence. The third and fourth rounds of the response fund projects were implemented in this reporting year. Cumulatively AAWAZ awarded 29 projects among 21 partners, across a very broad range of relevant themes. In keeping with the intention of testing innovative approaches, the AAWAZ team found that 10 projects demonstrated change in implementation. At this stage in the programme, our recommendation would be that the AAWAZ programme focuses on learning from projects with proven innovative results on neglected or promising areas that have arisen during the lifespan of the programme. These include modern slavery, working with youth leaders, and deepening knowledge of approaches to address the root causes of inter-faith, sectarian and gender based violence. This can directly inform future programming.

In addition, our assessment suggests that learning from the response fund was used less than learning under outputs 1 to 3, to adapt AAWAZ activities as the programme developed. Partners should continue

to share lessons across the programme and with DFID, to inform thinking for the proposed new DFID programme.

A powerful example of the success of the Strategic Learning Unit's response fund mechanism is Action Against Poverty Pakistan (AAP)'s work bringing together women sanitary workers (who often belong to religious minorities) to campaign against corruption. They were being paid in cash (rather than electronically) and the resulting corruption (skimming of funds from pay packages) was stripping them of a minimum wage and effectively resulting in a form of slave labour. In addition, this was contributing to a cycle of poverty and child labour, where some women described having to send their children to work, (or as the lesser of two evils, just not to school), to ensure food was available for the family, as a direct result of not being paid enough to live on. By supporting women affected through trainings and network-building, AAP successfully supported them to challenge the practice of payments being made in cash. The project eliminated this practice in three districts in South Punjab. Scaling up work like this could have a profound impact on the lives of poor people and learning should be maximised from such projects to inform future programming.

Working with provincial governments

The AAWAZ programme has invested time in engaging with both of the relevant provincial governments, with more demand from the government of KP (GoKP). The AAWAZ programme developed an AAWAZ-GoKP monitoring and evaluation working group responding to this interest and conducted joint field visits using a mutually agreed and standardized evaluation framework and survey instrument. Although the method or form of regular interaction need not be the same for both provincial government, the work in Punjab does not have the same detailed level of exposure to programme activities at the provincial level. Different mechanisms for ensuring communication with district level and the provincial level government in Punjab should be explored to support smooth operations.

Recommendations

- Use monitoring and evaluation tools and best practice from the Strategic Learning Unit to deepen knowledge (qualitative and quantitative) of thematic areas/approaches that have arisen from the programme over the past five years: particularly relating to youth, modern slavery and religious minorities to inform the design of the proposed successor programme;
- DFID and AAWAZ partners should explore different mechanisms to ensure communication with the district level and provincial government of Punjab, including updates through informal or formal DFID-GoPb discussion; joint field visits; a committee or regular meetings between AAWAZ and the Planning & Development Department.

D: VALUE FOR MONEY & FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE

Key cost drivers and performance

The total allocated budget for 16/17 was £6.63m. As of February 2016, AAWAZ spent £6.17m (94%) and was on track to spend the total allocated budget by May 2017. This is a second year in a row where the programme has spent more than 95% of its allocated budget. The AAWAZ programme budget comprises fees, operations and programme activities. This year 46% of the total budget was spent on fees, which includes staff salaries of the Management Organisation as well as other partner organisations. Due to the large scale targeted outreach of this programme, staff salaries have consistently remained the major cost driver of this programme. The programme, however, has managed to rationalise teams and brought down this percentage from 51% last year to 46%. Operational expenses took up 14% of the budget. Programme activities consumed 40% of the budget. AAWAZ Aagahi Centres (AACs) remain the major cost driver under this category.

Following the recommendation in the last annual review, the programme has categorised its programme activities into five different pathways. The expenditure share of each pathway is: social mobilisation (34%), capacity building (8%), awareness raising (23%), planning and management (14%) and advocacy actions (21%).

VfM performance compared to the original VfM proposition in the business case

Last year, AAWAZ added new and more relevant indicators to the VFM framework as compared to the indicators proposed in the original business case. The programme conducted an independent Value for

Money review using desk analysis and a case study approach based on the revised indicators. This report has provided DFID with fresh evidence on the economy, efficiency, effectiveness and equity aspects of the programme. For every £10 of the programme cost spent, over 6 citizens felt safer; 6 more citizens use public services; over 6 citizens are more satisfied with their use of public services; and over 2 citizens have more choice and control over their own development and are better able to hold decision makers to account. The programme continued to carry out cost-benefit analyses where project benefits were quantified and compared with the actual cost of the programme.

Assessment of whether the programme continues to represent value for money

The VfM review confirms that the programme continues to demonstrate good value for money. This is further supported by anecdotal evidence collected by the Annual Review team during their field visits, set out below:

Economy: AAWAZ achieved its programme objectives whilst ensuring robust procurement policies, as well operational and financial guidelines, were in place to get the best possible prices for given inputs. There have been four audits of AAWAZ since its inception and no procurement related issues have been highlighted. The independent VFM review also conducted a thorough activity-based costing analysis in which they assessed a few major unit costs of the programme and found them to be within a reasonable range.

Efficiency: AAWAZ has published various case studies which show that the impact of this programme is reaching the village-level. The annual cost of mobilising a citizen is less than £35. It is estimated that the work of AAWAZ over the past five years affected 6.96 million¹¹ citizens. This means that AAWAZ contributed positively to the lives of each citizen with less than £5 over a period of five years (less than £1 per citizen per year). On the whole, the programme reach is estimated to be 10 million people living in 4,500 settlements at a unit cost of £3.385.

Effectiveness: As one example, as outlined above, at the outcome level, the programme achieved the target of 67% citizens using public services, 75% of whom are satisfied. It cost the programme £1.69 to support each additional citizen being able to use public services. The programme was highly effective in support citizens to get access to services, at comparably low cost.

Equity: AAWAZ programme focuses on reducing gender-based discrimination, reducing the prevalence and impact of religious-based conflict on minorities; and supporting the rights of other marginalised groups like transgender and people with disabilities.

Quality of financial management

The programme demonstrated strong financial management both at the Management Organisation and downstream partner level. Compliance with all policies and procedures was regularly ensured. EY Ford Rhodes (EYFR) was engaged to carry out a detailed review of the internal control environment of the Management Organisation, partner organisations and 12 selected community partner organisations (CPOs). The Management Organisation along with the implementing partners developed an action plan for the specific issues identified and ensured that this action plan was implemented.

To safeguard UK taxpayer's funds, the programme team ensured that DAI and all partners had the right systems in place to detect and report fraud in a timely manner. To validate this argument, the annual review team further looked into the selection and disbursement mechanism of the grants made under the AAWAZ response fund. It was found that the selection of all grantees was made in accordance with the procurement policies. DAI also mitigated the fiduciary risk by ensuring payments upon completion of pre-agreed milestones, and conducting delivery chain mapping at the request of the DFID team this year.

The AAWAZ programme has spent 140% of the total allocated budget for programme related activities. The majority of this overspending has been observed for grants made under the response fund where £.057 million has been spent against a total budget of £0.28 million. The overspend came about as a result of uncertainty regarding when funds would become available for the costed extension. The

¹¹ 6.965 million citizens, as reported in Data Quality Assessment.

AAWAZ programme was able to manage this by slowing down activities in the last quarter of the financial year, whilst still delivering against targets.

Recommendations

- DAI and DFID to reflect on learnings from the transition of the old contract to the contract extension period to ensure orderly programme wind down and exit.

| | |
|---|-----------------------------|
| Date of last narrative financial report | 29 th March 2017 |
| Date of last audited annual statement | 17 th March 2017 |

E: RISK

Overall risk rating: moderate.

The risk is moderate overall.

Overview of programme risk

AAWAZ divides its risks into four different categories. These are: (i) External risks (ii) Activity risks (iii) Financial risks and (iv) Human resources risks. The programme team have documented all their risks in a risk register which is regularly reviewed and updated by the programme team.

External Risks: Since AAWAZ works on raising awareness about sensitive social issues, including the rights of women and minorities, there is a constant threat of backlash from extremist segments. In many areas, the operations are conducted with a low profile to avoid harmful attention, whilst in other areas, extensive procedures have to be followed to gain government permission to conduct activities. This has caused delays in implementation and at times reduced the effectiveness of activities. The programme also faces access risks from time to time, due to the shrinking operating space for civil society organisations, particularly in southern parts of Punjab and KP.

To mitigate these risks, the programme has adopted a three pronged approach to ensure buy-in and raise awareness about the objectives of the programme at all levels. First, it has brought on board a consortium of partners with strong local links, who are able to provide an early warning system of their own for any signs of backlash. Second, the team has ensured effective coordination with government at multiple levels. Third, it has engaged highly socially credible platforms like mosques to raise awareness about the programme.

Delivery Risk: The programme has already entered into its last year and there is a risk that many AAWAZ-created networks will not be able to operate effectively once the programme ends in 2018. To ensure that these networks are able to continue without DFID's support, AAWAZ has focused on forming a strong network of trained volunteers who will be able to continue the work with minimal supervision. Moreover, Women Assemblies have been established at district levels, and it is expected that these networks will continue with the advocacy campaigns. Some members of ADFs have secured roles in local governments and this is also an avenue for mitigated this risk to sustainability. It is expected that members will be able to use these new platforms to build support for inclusive democracy and sustainable development. AAWAZ is also exploring opportunities to form synergies with programmes like CDIP and Accountable Justice in Pakistan Programme (AJPP), which can continue to provide support and guidance to AVFs, AUFs and ADFs in the longer run.

Financial Risk: AAWAZ has managed its financial risk by putting in place a strong financial management system. They have also ensured well defined procurement policies along with strong internal controls and accounting systems as summarised above. All audit reports were unqualified last year.

Human Resources risk: It is critical that the AAWAZ programme retains high quality human resources to deliver work in the final year of the programme. .

Outstanding actions from risk assessment: none.

F: COMMERCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

Delivery against planned timeframe

The programme is delivering according to schedule and is on track to deliver against milestone targets in the final period of the programme.

Performance of partnership (s)

Contract: The programme goes above and beyond contractual requirements. DAI were motivated to make changes to senior management following DFID Key Relationship Management (KRM) scores. We do not recommend that there are changes to methodology or staffing in the final period of the contract. DAI have also managed the issue of currency fluctuation to the best of their ability.

Partnership: The AAWAZ Programme has a Steering Committee, which includes DAI and the four lead implementing partners. This Committee discusses strategic programme issues and there is a rotating chair to ensure that the spirit of equal partnership is sustained. The review team met with all consortia members and discussed how the partnership is working. Consortia partners felt there was a spirit of cooperation and that the Steering Committee was effective for surfacing issues and agreeing actions. DAI have usefully supported partners to strengthen their systems. For example, DAI recognised that they had to challenge effectively to improve systems across the consortium, and DFID helped DAI with compliance training. DAI and CSO programme partners have developed good working relationships across other DFID programmes, UNFPA, UN Women, and other institutions. This work shows that DAI have gone above and beyond in partnering with organisations beyond the requirements of the logframe.

Asset monitoring and control

DAI and all CSO partners manage their assets using system based asset registers where the assets are recorded and updated regularly. The register records complete information of all the assets including their quantity and the users. Asset codes have been allocated to each asset to be used as the unique identifier. The Annual Review team carried out an asset spot check of DAI and three out of four implementing partners on 19 April 2017. All of these assets were found present, well maintained and properly tagged. It is concluded that DAI and other partners are managing assets in line with DFID guidelines.

AAWAZ implementing partners have revised their operating models, work plans and delivery approach for the programme's extension period (to May 2018) to ensure effective and efficient programme delivery. For example, SAP-PK is now running district level operations from their central office in Lahore and the Aurat Foundation is using local partners' (Community Based Organisations – CBOs) offices to conduct village and UC level activities. This revised approach has made some assets from district offices available to transfer to local partners (CBOs) who have worked on the AAWAZ programme. A disposition plan has been submitted by DAI outlining the assets which are available to be transferred to CBOs. The transfer of assets to CBOs will enhance their capacity to continue their work on programme initiatives and to support local communities beyond AAWAZ.

Recommendation:

DFID to transfer ownership of available assets to selected Community Based Organisations (CBOs) according to the disposition plan submitted by DAI in consultation with implementing partners.

G: CONDITIONALITY

Update on partnership principles (if relevant)

AAWAZ is a demand side, voice and accountability programme and all funding is going to civil society organisations through a management firm. It does not contain any elements of budget support or financial aid to any government department. It is part of the wider aid relationship between the UK and Pakistan, which is based on an assessment of government's commitment to our Partnership Principles. DFID Pakistan's assessment is that the government is demonstrating a credible commitment to the Partnership Principles. DFID can therefore continue to deliver on AAWAZ programme activities.

H: MONITORING & EVALUATION

Evidence and evaluation

This year, DAI improved refined their assessment tools, and were successful in developing and implementing a robust MIS system for data analysis of the work done by DAI and CSO partner organisations. The monitoring and evaluation team carried out Data Quality Assessment across all 45 districts. This tool enabled the team to assess whether the data collected met the standards defined in the monitoring and evaluation framework of AAWAZ in terms of validity, precision and timeliness.

The programme team have weekly meetings with the programme partner, ad hoc dialogue as issues arise, and conduct regular field visits (from frequent informal programme team visits to visits from senior leadership). They also conduct quarterly reviews of progress and ensure that the annual review is conducted on time. This year, the annual review team was selected from other areas of the Department, and not from the programme team in DFID, to achieve a degree of independence. The annual review team conducted field visits, analysed monitoring and evaluation reports and met with DAI and the four CBO partners to support the conclusions found in this review.

More details on monitoring and evaluation work are captured in the narrative under output 4, as this programme has an output with dedicated targets on this area. The following captures highlights and additional information:

- The AAWAZ monitoring and evaluation team worked closely with the KP government to develop a standardised evaluation framework. The team was made part of the AAWAZ-GoKP monitoring and evaluation working group, in which some members were representatives of KP Planning & Development (P&D) Department and Monitoring and Evaluation Directorate. The monitoring and evaluation team participated and supported the group's planning processes, which also helped to build a shared understanding about the AAWAZ programme and increased the potential for coordinated monitoring and evaluation efforts in the future.
- Moreover, the monitoring and evaluation team conducted the third round of follow-on surveys from 3,200 households, to track the progress of the programme activities over time. The data collection activity spanned over 16 districts, and was completed on time. The final report drafting is in process. The AAWAZ programme has also completed a third party Value for Money review using a case study approach and desk analysis. This review will validate, refine and calibrate the existing VFM framework.
- During 2016-17, a total of six research studies and five policy briefs were developed by the AAWAZ Strategic Learning Unit. The purpose of these studies was to deepen knowledge and understanding of the various aspects of the issues faced by women, transgender and religious minorities.
- This year DAI has established a monitoring and evaluation working group of all DFID funded programmes managed by the same supplier. The purpose of this group is to build synergies, and coordinate and establish an information sharing protocol. This working group will improve the overall outreach of programmes and will help avoid duplication of efforts.